



U.S. Capitol building, circa 1890. Photograph by Walter J. Hussey.

Friends and Enemies in Washington: Joseph F. Smith's Letter to Susa Young Gates, March 21, 1889

David M. Whitchurch and Mallory Hales Perry

On March 21, 1889, Joseph F. Smith wrote to his friend Susa Young Gates, “I am not overly hilarious to day for we have had discouraging news from Washington . . . all of which looks bilious for us.”¹ Smith had just returned to Salt Lake City from Washington, DC, where he was acting “as [the Church’s] agent in political matters . . . to assist in bringing the claims of Utah to be admitted into the Union as a State, before the country and before Congress.”² Included with Smith’s news to Gates was a list of people who were “urging their own [federal] appointments” to powerful positions in Utah.³ Those seeking these appointments were effectively following a ruling from the Republican Party to “rigidly [enforce]” laws intended to curb the power of the Latter-day Saint leaders in Utah and put an end to polygamy.⁴

In Smith’s letter to Gates, he makes reference to two other well known figures—Grover Cleveland, the former Democratic President of the United States whom he considered a friend to the Church, and Kate Field, a popular

DAVID M. WHITCHURCH (DWhitchurch@byu.edu) is a professor of Ancient Scripture at Brigham Young University. He received his BS from Utah State University, and his MA and PhD from Brigham Young University. He specializes in the history of the English Bible and biblical geography. He has taught at Brigham Young University Jerusalem Center for Near Eastern Studies, participated in excavations at a Graeco-Roman site in Fayoum, Egypt, and conducted extensive research on Joseph F. Smith. He is a member of the Society of Bible Literature and American Research Center in Egypt.

MALLORY HALES PERRY (malloryhperry@gmail.com) graduated with honors in psychology from BYU. As an undergraduate student she worked as a research assistant in Religious Education. She currently lives in Boston with her husband, Bryan, where she works as an administrative assistant at Kingsley Montessori School.

anti-Mormon journalist and lecturer who he wrote was a “vixon . . . with her acrid temper and rattling stinging tongue.”⁵ The letter gives insight into the political and social climate in Utah the year prior to President Wilford Woodruff’s public announcement declaring that The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints was no longer “teaching polygamy or plural marriage, nor permitting any person to enter into its practice” (Official Declaration 1). This article focuses on the historical context of Smith’s letter, briefly highlighting those seeking federal appointments, and provides commentary regarding Grover Cleveland and Kate Field’s positions regarding the Latter-day Saints.

Joseph F. Smith and Susan (Susa) Amelia Young Gates

Joseph F. Smith was born on November 13, 1838, in Far West, Missouri, during a time of great persecution against The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints. At the age of five-and-a-half, his father, Hyrum Smith, and uncle, Joseph Smith Jr., were martyred at Carthage, Illinois. In 1846, Mary Fielding (Smith’s mother), Joseph F., Martha Ann (Smith’s full sister), and three other children from Hyrum’s first marriage fled Nauvoo, Illinois. After enduring debilitating hardships at Winter Quarters (Florence, Nebraska), Mary and her family migrated with other Saints to the Great Salt Lake Valley in the spring of 1848. Four years after arriving in Salt Lake City Smith’s mother died, leaving the thirteen-year-old Smith and his siblings orphaned.⁶

A series of events occurred after the death of Smith’s mother that placed him squarely on a path of lifetime service for his religious beliefs. During



Joseph F. Smith, date unknown, circa 1888–1890, Photograph by Charles R. Savage. Image courtesy Harold B. Lee Library Digital Collections, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah.

Susa Young Gates, date unknown. Photograph by Charles R. Savage. Image courtesy Harold B. Lee Library Digital Collections, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah.



the April 1854 General Conference, Brigham Young announced that “Joseph Smith (son of Hyrum),” although only fifteen years old, should serve as a missionary “To the Pacific Isles” (Hawaii).⁷ Following four years of missionary service in Hawaii, Smith returned to Salt Lake City, where he soon married Levira Annette Clark, the first of six plural wives.⁸ Smith lived during a time when the Latter-day Saints and polygamy were topics of national discussion. After being called to the Apostleship, Smith became a high-profile target in the U.S. government’s anti-polygamy campaign.⁹

Susan Amelia Young Gates, affectionately known as Susa, was born March 18, 1856, to Brigham and Lucy Bigelow Young.¹⁰ Susa lived in Salt Lake City until the age of fourteen, when her father moved her mother, Susa, and her younger sister to St. George to live in Southern Utah. At age sixteen, Susa married Alma Dunford, a twenty-one-year-old dentist. Together, they had two children. The couple divorced a little less than five years later.¹¹

Shortly after her divorce, Susa attended Brigham Young Academy in Provo, Utah, where she took classes, and at the request of Academy president Karl G. Maeser used her musical talents to begin the music department.¹² During the summer of 1879, Susa accompanied her aunt Zina Young on a speaking mission to Hawaii.¹³ While there, she became acquainted with Jacob Gates, who was serving as a missionary on the Church plantation at Laie. Shortly after Jacob returned to St. George, he and Susa married.¹⁴

Susa and Jacob were well suited for each other. Joseph F. Smith described Jacob as “a man of sterling integrity, simple and domestic in his tastes, a wide reader, [and] a keen observer.”¹⁵ The couple would later be called to serve as missionaries at the Church plantation in Hawaii (1885–1889). In all likelihood, it was during two of these years, while Joseph F. Smith was serving a mission in the islands, that he became acquainted with Susa and Jacob.¹⁶ Susa would go on to become an influential women’s leader in the Church and a prominent spokesperson regarding women’s issues.¹⁷

Historical Background—Utah Petitions for Statehood

Efforts were made to organize a civil government in Utah soon after the Saints began to settle the Great Basin.¹⁸ In March 1849, a constitutional convention was held in Salt Lake City devoted to framing a document that could be presented to the U.S. Congress requesting that the “State of Deseret” be admitted into the Union.¹⁹ Rather than granting statehood, however, Congress refused their petition and in its place passed “The Organic Act of the Territory of Utah.” The new bill created “a temporary government, by the name of the Territory of Utah; and when admitted as a state, the said territory, or any portion of the same shall be, received into the Union.”²⁰ It also provided a provision that “the governor, secretary, chief justice and associate justices, attorney and marshal [of Utah Territory] . . . with the advice and consent of the Senate [be] appointed by the President of the United States.”²¹

When the main body of the Church migrated west, outside the borders of the United States, the Latter-day Saints believed that the Great Basin would insulate them from the persecutions they had previously experienced. However, with the passage of the Organic Act, persecution continued, particularly by elected officials in Washington, DC, albeit most of it came in varying forms of legislation from the federal government. With anti-Mormon sentiment running high during the latter half of the nineteenth century, several government appointees arrived, determined to end Mormon theocracy.²² Over the years, the policies and practices of many of these appointees grew into what one contemporary reporter called “a war of extermination” against the Saints.²³

The leadership of the Church responded to the haranguing from these federal appointees with increased determination to acquire statehood, which if granted, would allow them to elect their own government leaders. Between 1850–1883, five petitions for statehood were delivered to Congress. All failed. The primary reasons for refusal centered on two fundamental issues: (1) the Church’s belief in and practice of polygamy; and (2) a perception that “The Mormons were determined to make Utah an independent Government, controlled by the Mormon priesthood.”²⁴

The Church, Plural Marriage, and Self-Governance

Following the Church's August 29, 1852, public statement announcing the doctrine of "plurality of wives,"²⁵ efforts were made by federal officials to enact laws making it illegal to practice polygamy; and between 1862–1887, Congress enacted four anti-polygamy acts: the Morrill Act (1862), Poland Act (1874), Edmunds Act (1882), and Edmunds-Tucker Act (1884). The Edmunds-Tucker Act was particularly detrimental, since it gave the federal government the added authority to disincorporate the Church, escheat Church property and financial assets, and disfranchise women voters.²⁶

While many saw polygamy as Utah's greatest obstacle to achieving statehood, one journalist considered it "the smallest part of the Mormon question."²⁷ Even before the Saints arrived in the Great Basin there had been national discourse about the desire by the Mormons to establish a government independent from the United States.²⁸ People worried that members of the Church would give greater allegiance to the Church and their leaders than they would to the state and national governments.²⁹ With the memory of the American Civil War still fresh in the nation's mind, Utah looked to some like a frightening echo of the South's rebellion. Just as slavery had rallied the Southern states, so "polygamy [was considered] the war-cry" of the "Mormons."³⁰ And like the Confederacy, Utah's Church leaders were viewed as those preparing their people for battle.

With the passage of the Edmunds Act (1882), the leadership of the Church chose civil disobedience rather than submit to what they considered to be unjust laws, and the leading officials went into hiding to avoid arrest.³¹ Joseph F. Smith went to Hawaii, where he remained from January 1885 until June 1887.³² In all likelihood, it would have been during these two years in Hawaii that Smith would have gotten to know Jacob and Susa Gates so well.

Federal Appointees in the Territory of Utah

In his March 1889 letter to Susan Gates, Joseph F. Smith mentions the dismal situation developing in Washington, DC. According to Smith, "Zane, Baskin and Kentucky Smith [were] all urging their own appointments to positions on the Utah Commission or on the judicial Bench, and with some prospect of success." He also writes that "J. R. McBride is reaching out for the Marshalship with strong backing."³³ These men had all been involved for years in anti-Mormon politics, but had lost their appointments when Grover Cleveland won the presidency in 1884. When Republican Benjamin Harrison took office in January 1889, these men petitioned the newly elected president for another appointment in Utah. While their credentials seemed respectable, these men had worked intermittently over a period of three decades to curb the

political power of the Latter-day Saint leaders and were determined to remove as much as possible every influence of the Church from civic office.

Charles S. Zane, an influential lawyer who had been appointed Chief Justice of the Utah Supreme Court in 1884, quickly made a name for himself as an opponent to polygamy. His interpretation of anti-polygamy legislation allowed for punishments to multiply based on the length of the defendant's plural marriage.³⁴ Zane frequently selected juries made up of non-Mormons who agreed with his harsh sentencing.³⁵ It was said of Zane that to be tried in his court was "in effect to be convicted."³⁶

Robert Baskin began practicing law in Utah in 1865, where he quickly became known for his hot temper and dislike of the Mormon "theocracy."³⁷ He is credited with drafting the anti-polygamy Cullom Bill (1869), which among other things sought to strengthen the Morrill Act by revoking the voting rights of anyone who even believed in plural marriage. After considerable debate in Congress, the Cullom Bill was eventually defeated.³⁸ In early 1889, Baskin went to Washington to campaign for stricter anti-polygamy laws.³⁹

Harvey W. "Kentucky" Smith was a lawyer who made a name for himself in anti-Mormon circles in Utah and Idaho. He was influential in creating the Idaho Test Oath law that had disfranchised Latter-day Saints in that state. He later became an associate Justice of the Utah Supreme Court.⁴⁰

Like "Kentucky" Smith, John R. McBride was a lawyer who was well known for his anti-Mormon rhetoric. He practiced law in Utah and Washington, and in 1889 he became a member of the Republican National Committee. Among other things, McBride was known for a scathing article about Utah Mormons that was published in the *International Review*.⁴¹

Kate Field and the Great Mormon Reform Business

In addition to the political challenges that Church leaders confronted, they also faced considerable problems from a constant flood of negative press. Newspapers throughout the U.S. were filled with articles about the Mormons from adventurers and writers. Notable among the sensational journalists in the 1880s was Kate Field. In his letter to Susa Young Gates, Joseph F. Smith expressed his displeasure of Field's reporting. "That vixen, Kate Field is at work, with her acrid temper and rattling stinging tongue."⁴²

Kate Field's notoriety and her outspoken crusade against the Mormons has been largely overlooked in Mormon circles, but at the time of her death in 1896, the *New York Tribune* reported that she was "one of the best-known women of America."⁴³ Field wrote on a variety of topics, publishing more than three thousand articles in her career in journals and newspapers that included the *New York Tribune*, *Boston Courier*, *Chicago Tribune*, *Philadelphia Press*,



Kate Field, 1871. Photograph by Charles Reutlinger. Image courtesy Library of Congress.

Harper's Weekly, and the *North American Review*. By the 1880s, she was also known as an accomplished lecturer, which included a six-hour lecture series on the Mormons in Utah Territory.⁴⁴

Mary Katherine (Kate) Keemle Field, born in St. Louis, Missouri, October 1, 1838, grew up exposed to the power of both the theater and the press.⁴⁵ Her father, Joseph M. Field (1810–1856), was an actor, playwright, journalist, theater manager, and editor/owner of a daily newspaper. Field's mother, Eliza Riddle (1812–1871), was recognized as “an actress of note and reputation.”⁴⁶ Kate followed her parents to the stage where she began performing as a teenager, first in Boston and then in Europe.⁴⁷ She began her career as a journalist in her early twenties while living with her mother in Boston. Her intellect and wit made her a magnet for successful friends.⁴⁸ The topics of her lectures ranged from famous authors to sightseeing, but while traveling in the Western United States she found a topic that captured her attention—the Mormons.

In 1883, Kate Field visited Salt Lake City for a stop on her way to New Mexico. Originally she intended a stay of only a few days, but it extended well beyond that. Six weeks after she arrived she wrote to a friend, “I’m not yet ready to leave. I’m trying to get at the ‘true inwardness’ of the worst theocracy in the world today.”⁴⁹ She remained in Utah for eight months, immersing herself in the lives and culture of the Mormons, attending Church meetings and conferences, mingling among the people, and interviewing

anyone who would talk about their experiences with plural marriage or the Church's leadership.⁵⁰ Field particularly made friends with the non-Mormon "gentiles" and those who had left the Church, and the stories she collected and wrote about painted a troublesome picture of the Rocky Mountain Saints. Her "Mormon reports," sent to the eastern newspapers, carried titles such as "The Church above the State—How the Mormon Wickedness Began," and "Mormon Rebellion Proved by Documentary Evidence."⁵¹

When her friends back East questioned why she was giving so much attention on the Mormons, Kate explained that she had simply become "interested in a most extraordinary anomaly to such an extent as to desire to study it and to be able to form an intelligent opinion therein."⁵² When she finally returned to New England in November 1884, she decided to go on the lecture circuit to share her opinion of the Latter-day Saints. At the beginning of her crusade she wrote to a friend, "Much to my amazement, I'm in the grand moral reform business."⁵³

During the years that followed, Field delivered lectures about the Mormons to hundreds of audiences. Her message of moral reform was not so concerned with the immorality of Mormon polygamy, but rather the immorality of Mormonism itself, and its threat to the American republic.⁵⁴ In a letter to Reverend Andrew Peabody, a clergyman and professor of Christian Morals at Harvard University, Field summed up her argument: "I think leaders of opinion like yourself should know what Mormonism really means. You doubtless believe that it is a religion and therefore should be let alone. In reality it is a vast business and political machine bent upon undermining our government."⁵⁵ In a letter to a friend, Field enclosed a small card on which was written, "Mormonism is organized Treason!"⁵⁶ Needless to say, her message resonated and received enthusiastic praise. One reporter explained: "Other travellers to Utah have made but the briefest stays, and have been ready to gloss over the tale. Miss Field is telling the truth about it, and she does it with a courage, a vigor, an honesty, and a power that renders it one of the most potent influences in the national life of the times."⁵⁷ Field's crusade against the Church was no doubt a troublesome burden which Joseph F. Smith felt keenly. In his letter to Susa Young Gates he expressed his concern about Field's influence: "We can only hope for the best after we have done the best we can."⁵⁸

Grover Cleveland and the Mormons

Opposition against the LDS Church and its practices surfaced with renewed energy during the state constitutional convention held in Salt Lake City in June 1887.⁵⁹ Knowing that statehood provided greater autonomy and self-governance, Wilford Woodruff and the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles

Grover Cleveland, circa 1888.
Photograph courtesy U.S. National
Archives.



pressed forward to make their sixth petition to Congress for statehood.⁶⁰ For decades, politics in the nation's capital had been dominated by the Republican party, which had openly avowed in their 1884 party platform "That it is the duty of Congress to enact such laws as shall promptly and effectually suppress the system of polygamy within our Territories; divorce the political from the ecclesiastical power of the so-called Mormon church; and that the laws so enacted should be rigidly enforced."⁶¹ However, following the 1884 U.S. presidential election, political power shifted from the Republicans to the Democrats. With President Grover Cleveland now in charge, there seemed to be some hope among Church leaders that political headway could be made in finally achieving statehood. During the elections, the Democratic Party had supported increased rights and greater autonomy to residents throughout the Territory of Utah.⁶² While President Cleveland was not outspoken in his personal feelings on the Latter-day Saints, his policies toward Utah after the 1884 elections suggested that a real change was indeed going to happen.⁶³

The perception that leaders in the Church had about President Cleveland must have been significantly strengthened when he refused to add his signature to the 1887 Edmunds-Tucker Act after it had been passed by both houses of Congress.⁶⁴ Even though the bill entered into law, it was the first time in decades that a sitting president of the United States had looked favorably on Utah and its citizens.⁶⁵ It seems no surprise, then, that shortly

after the Edmunds-Tucker Act went into law, President Woodruff, the senior member of the Quorum of the Twelve, sent Joseph F. Smith and Charles W. Penrose to lobby government officials in Washington, DC.⁶⁶

After Cleveland took office in January 1885, he began appointing officials in the Territory of Utah who would administer the laws with greater equity than had been done by his predecessors. For example, Eli Murray, the incumbent governor of the territory, refused to work with a predominantly Mormon territorial legislature. Cleveland appointed as the new governor Caleb West, who proved to be much more sympathetic toward the Latter-day Saints. West reported to the Secretary of the Interior, that he had given “hearty encouragement and earnest support” in his efforts to bridge “the chasm that has separated the Mormon and non-Mormon people.”⁶⁷ Likewise, Cleveland removed Chief Justice Charles S. Zane, considered “the backbone of the [anti-polygamy] raid,”⁶⁸ replacing him with Elliott F. Sanford, who became known for a more lenient interpretation and administration of anti-polygamy laws.⁶⁹ Cleveland told Frank J. Cannon, son of George Q. Cannon, that with each appointment he wanted to select officials who he trusted “would execute and adjudicate the laws in Utah according to the most lenient Southern construction of Federal rights.”⁷⁰

In early 1888, Frank J. Cannon spent several weeks meeting with President Cleveland to discuss the Mormon question. Cannon later reported: “Mr. Cleveland . . . was as painstaking in acquiring information about [the Mormon people, their family life, their religion, and their politics] as he was in performing all the other duties of his office.”⁷¹ As conditions in Utah began to improve, Cleveland pled with Mormon leaders to “lay aside polygamy and ‘come and be like us’ and all the past will be forgiven.”⁷² A member of Cleveland’s staff reported that as Cannon and the president discussed the needs in Utah, Cleveland began to develop a “genuinely paternal interest in the people of Utah. . . . His humanity was enlisted, his conscience appealed to.”⁷³

President Joseph F. Smith returned to Utah in June 1888, where he remained for six months before returning to Washington, DC, in December. He returned to Salt Lake City again in March 1889, just after writing his letter to Gates; hence it is no surprise that Smith makes mention of Cleveland in the letter.⁷⁴ At that time, it had only been a few months since Cleveland had lost his bid for a second term as president.⁷⁵ Under the new leadership of Benjamin Harrison, anti-Mormons who had previously had federal appointments were once again seeking to return to Salt Lake City to continue what they started. With all this going on, it seems understandable that Smith would tell Gates, “I am not overly hilarious to day for we have had discouraging news from Washington, . . . all of which looks bilious for us.”⁷⁶

George Q. Cannon benefited from the new Utah appointments made by President Cleveland. In September 1888, Cannon had turned himself into the territorial authorities who had offered a \$500 reward for his capture. Up to that point, Church leaders had resisted arrest, threatened by the vindictive prosecution of Chief Justice Zane, but in 1888, Cleveland's new appointment, Chief Justice Elliot F. Sanford, offered Cannon the mild sentence of six months in the territorial penitentiary.

George Q. Cannon was released from prison on February 21, 1889.⁷⁷ One month later, Joseph F. Smith wrote in his letter to Susa: "Bro. Cannon greatly enjoys his freedom, and means to improve it. . . . Bro. Woodruff now goes and comes at will."⁷⁸ With his release, others, such as President Wilford Woodruff, were able to come out of hiding.⁷⁹ However, such was not the case with Smith. Even though Cannon had served his time and President Woodruff moved about freely, there was still an impending possibility of Smith's own arrest. "I have seen none of my family for several days," he wrote. "Some of my friends (?) are very anxious to interview me[.] But owing to circumstances over which I now have no control I am not anxious for the honor! I may be in stripes however by the time you get home. May be not."⁸⁰ It seems clear that his "friends" (followed by a question mark) refers to the federal authorities, especially since he follows it with the prospect of being in "stripes" (i.e., prison clothes).

Joseph F. Smith showed how far reaching President Cleveland's influence had been with his presidential pardons. "Bro. C. [Charles] W. Penrose has been pardoned by Pres. Cleveland, on the 2^d of this month," he notes, "one of his last official acts."⁸¹ It is no wonder that Joseph F. Smith said, "[President Cleveland] was our best friend and did us all the good that party interests would permit. He would have done more, if he dared. He was a brave man to dare <and do,> so much as he did. God bless Grover Cleveland."⁸² In 1894, after President Cleveland succeeded in defeating Benjamin Harrison for an unprecedented second non-consecutive term president of the United States, he would continue offering forgiveness to the Saints with "a proclamation of amnesty and pardon to all persons who have been convicted of polygamy under teachings of the Mormon Church."⁸³

Conclusion

Joseph F. Smith's letter to Susa Young Gates provides readers with a candid and personal view of the times. We see a very personal side of a member of the Quorum of the Twelve and his open reflections on the political circumstances of his day. Although the Church and its leaders were unsuccessful in their bid for statehood at the time the letter was written, the political tide

Mar. 21. 1889

My Dear Sister:—

Your favor of Feb. 7th came to hand Feb. 23^d, two days before I left Washington, since when I have been travelling, and very busy up to date. Hence my delay. This makes the 4th time, in a year, that I have run the gauntlet getting out and in the territory. I trust freedom will extend her blessed hand toward me and mine in the not-distant future.

I congratulate you on the joy and triumph of yourself and Jacob on Jan. 19th, an ever memorable day for Master Harvey Harris! and

Joseph F. Smith to Susa Young Gates, March 21, 1889, 1. Image courtesy Church History Library, Salt Lake City, Utah.

eventually turned, showing what a good “friend” Grover Cleveland would be in helping the Church achieve its long sought-after quest for statehood.⁸⁴ Smith closes his letter with some family news and this meaningful declaration: “They are my friends who love the cause of Zion.”⁸⁵ President Cleveland was seen as one of those friends.

The Letter

Mar. 21 1889

My Dear Sister:—

Your favor of Feb 7th came to hand Feb 23^d, two days before I left Washington, since when I have been travelling, and very busy up to date. Hence my delay. This makes the 4th time, in a year, that I have run the gauntlet getting out and in, the territory.⁸⁶ I trust freedom will extend her blessed hand toward me and mine in the not distant future.⁸⁷

I congratulate you on the joy and triumph of yourself and Jacob⁸⁸ on Jan. 19th, an ever memorable day for Master Harvey Harris!⁸⁹ and [p. 1] and but little less so to you who bore all the pains and realized all the suffering that gave birth to maternal joy on that occasion.

I also congratulate Nellie and Fred.⁹⁰ Well may he be “radiant,” two boys on one mission would mak almost any new beginner feel rather important.⁹¹ Of course Jacob is an older hand at the business, and with such help as he has, it is only fair to suppose he should have three to Fred’s two! That is quite right very equally sized!⁹²

7.15 p.m. I commenced this about noon. I have attended two meetings since, and lots of company between times, all <on> urgent business of personal and public interests. I hope you will excuse the fore part of this missive, and pardon the balance. I am in good health and [p. 2] tolerable spirits. I do not think I am one who soars aloft in the garret⁹³ to day and flops around in the cellar tomorrow, but I freely admit that I am considerably more jubilant some times than at others.

I am not overly hilarious to day for we have had discouraging news from Washington. Namely that Zane,⁹⁴ Baskin and Kentucky Smith are all at the capital urging their own appointments to positions on the Utah Commission or on the judicial Bench, and with some prospect of success. Also that J. R. M^eBride is reaching out for the Marshalship with strong backing all [p 3] of which looks bilious for us. Furthermore that that vixon, Kate Field is at work, with her acrid temper and rattling stinging tongue to help them.

We can only hope for the best after we have done the best we can. Bro. F. S. R⁹⁵ will probably start again for the “Seat of war” in a day or two.

Bro. Cannon greatly enjoys his freedome, and means to improve it. His folks are still scattered. Bro. Woodruff now goes and comes at will. Bro. C. W. Penrose has been pardoned by Pres. Cleveland, on the 2^d of this month one of his last official acts. He was our best friend and did us all the good that party interests would permit. He would have done more, if he dared. He was a brave man to dare <and do,> so much as he did. God bless Grover Cleveland.

The 9th prox will soon roll round [p. 4] and soon thereafter, I suppose you will be casting up a c.s with Neptune.⁹⁶ I wish you a safe and pleasant passage home. I expect this will be my last missive to you, on the Islands, and you will not have time

to answer it until you get home expect I shall see you some time in the future how, where or when, time will determine.

I got a letter from J.⁹⁷ this evening they were all well I have seen none of my family for several days Some of my friends (?) are very anxious to interview me But owing to circumstances [p. 5] over which I now have no control I am not anxious for the honor!

I may be in stripes however by the time you get home. May be not. Whether I am or not I shall be pleased to see you and Jacob, and receive as well as give the warm hand of friend and fellowship. I will excuse you or pardon as you please for speaking so warmly about my spectacles Susa for were it not for them I could not see your eye lashes much less look very far into your thoughts.

I love my friends and they are my friends who love the cause of Zion, or at least, I am theirs. Give my love to your Mother⁹⁸ to Jacob the friends at Laie & Honolulu and adieu till I can greet you welcome home. My folks would say aloha nui⁹⁹ if they knew I was writing. So accept it from your Brother, Jos. F. [p. 6]

Notes

1. Joseph F. Smith to Susan (Susa) Amelia Young Gates, March 21, 1888, 3–4, Church History Library, Salt Lake City, Utah, used with permission (hereafter cited as JFS to SYG).

2. Ibid. Smith had been sent to Washington by Wilford Woodruff, president of the Quorum of the Twelve and acting president of the Church, “to assist in bringing the claims of Utah to be admitted into the Union as a State, before the country and before Congress.” See Wilford Woodruff to Joseph F. Smith, in Joseph Fielding Smith, *Life of Joseph F. Smith*, (Salt Lake City: Deseret News Press, 1938), 288–89.

3. JFS to SYG, 3–4. The federal appointments included Charles S. Zane, Robert N. Baskin, Harvey W. “Kentucky” Smith, and John R. McBride. More will be said about these individuals later in the article.

4. Donald B. Johnson and Kirk H. Porter, comps., *National Party Platforms, 1840–1972* (Chicago: University of Illinois Press, 1973), 74.

5. JFS to SYG, 4.

6. See “Smith, Joseph F,” in *Encyclopedia of Mormonism*, Daniel H. Ludlow, ed., 4 vols. (New York: Macmillan, 1992), 3:1349–50.

7. See *Deseret News* (Great Salt Lake City, UT) 4, no. 11 (April 13, 1854): 2. Smith would eventually serve a total of six missions, three to the Sandwich Islands (1854–1858; 1864, 1885–1887) and three to Great Britain (1860–1863, 1874–1875, 1877).

8. Joseph F. Smith’s other marriages included: Julina Lambson (1866, div.); Sarah Ellen Richards (1868); Edna Lambson (1871); Alice Ann Kimball (1883); and, Mary Taylor Schwartz (1884). See Joseph F. Smith, *From Prophet to Son: Advice of Joseph F. Smith to His Missionary Sons*, Hyrum M. Smith and Scott G. Kenny, eds. (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 1981) 22. See also letter dated December 1, 1868, forthcoming in Richard N. Holzapfel and David M. Whitchurch, eds., “My Dear Sister”: *Letters between Joseph F. Smith and His Sister Martha Ann* (2013).

9. Smith was called into the apostleship on July 1, 1866, at the age of twenty-seven. He was called as a counselor in the First Presidency at the same time. He would continue serve in the First Presidency on multiple occasions until eventually becoming the sixth president of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints (1901–1918). By 1918, the

year Smith died, Church membership had increased to nearly one-half million.

10. Susa Amelia Young Gates's name transformed throughout her life. Depending on circumstance and year, she was known as "Susa," "Susannah," "Susanne," "Susan," "Su," "Suz," and "Auntie Gates." See Susa Young Gates, "The Editor Presumes to Talk about Herself," *Young Woman's Journal* 7, no.4 (January 1996): 200–03.

11. Vicky Burgess-Olson, *Sister Saints* (Provo, UT: Brigham Young University Press, 1978), 67–68.

12. In her recollections, she spoke about the impact of Maeser on her life: "Brother Maeser taught me to think out the answer of my problem. Aunt Zina and my mother, . . . taught me to pray for the solution, but Brother Maeser set my feet on the upward road of thorough self-development," as cited in Burgess-Olson, *Sister Saints*, 68.

13. Zina Diantha Huntington Jacobs Smith Young (b. January 31, 1821, d. August 28, 1901).

14. Burgess-Olson, *Sister Saints*, 70–71.

15. Quoted in *Ibid.*, 71.

16. Smith had been sent to Hawaii to avoid arrest by federal marshals.

17. Gates became active in numerous women's organizations in Utah and throughout the country. She was a founding organizer of the National Household Economics Organization, served as a delegate to five congresses of the International Council of Women, was the primary organizer of the Utah Chapter of the Daughters of the American Revolution, and belonged to the National Women's Press Club. Having taken courses at the University of Deseret and Brigham Young Academy, she became a respected advocate for Latter-day Saint women and wrote several books and numerous articles about women's issues in the Church. She also dedicated much of her time to genealogy and temple work and, for a time, was the head of the research department and library of the Genealogical Society of Utah. After returning from her mission to Hawaii, she conceived the idea of publishing a journal for the young women in the Church. The first issue of the *Young Woman's Journal* was printed in October 1889, with Gates as managing editor. The Church published the *Relief Society Magazine*, the first official magazine for women in 1915. The *Relief Society Magazine* preserved the history of the Relief Society, reported on general Relief Society conferences, and contained articles on gospel topics, poetry, housekeeping aides, and the progress of women worldwide. Gates was selected by President Joseph F. Smith as its first editor (1914–1922). She died in Salt Lake City at the age of seventy-seven. See Andrew Jenson, "Susa Young Gates" in *Latter-Day Saint Biographical Encyclopedia: A Compilation of Biographical Sketches of Prominent Men and Women in the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-Day Saints*, 4 vols. (Salt Lake City: A. Jenson History Co., 1901), 2:626–28; see also Burgess-Olson, *Sister Saints*, 66, 73.

18. See B. H. Roberts, *A Comprehensive History of The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints*, 6 vols. (Provo, UT: The Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints, 1965), 3:422–29, 434. See also, Gustive O. Larson, *The "Americanization" of Utah for Statehood* (San Marino, CA: Huntington Library, 1971), 217.

19. The proposed officers presented before Congress included Brigham Young (governor), Willard Richards (secretary), Heber C. Kimball (chief justice), and Newel K. Whitney and John Taylor (associate justices), Daniel H. Wells (attorney general), and Horace S. Eldredge (marshal). Roberts, *Comprehensive History of the Church*, 3:427.

20. Organic Act of the Territory of Utah, September 9, 1850, 9 Stat. 453, Sec. 1.

21. *Ibid.*, Sec. 11. See also Abraham O. Smoot, comp., "An Act to Establish a Territorial Government for Utah," in *Compiled Laws of the Territory of Utah* (Salt Lake City: Deseret News, 1876), 32.

22. John R. McBride, "Utah and Mormonism," *International Review* 12 (February

1882): 191–92; Orma Linford, “The Mormons and the Law: The Polygamy Cases” *Utah Law Review* 9 (1964–1965): 328.

23. “Belva A. Lockwood Has a Good Word for the Mormons,” *Deseret News*, February 29, 1887, 7. See also Roberts, *Comprehensive History of the Church*, 3:509–10, 514–19.

24. “Crimes Committed in Utah: Miss Kate Field Favors a National Marriage Law,” *New York Times*, November 22, 1885.

25. The announcement that plural marriage was an official practice of the Church was made by Orson Pratt of the Quorum of the Twelve. See *Journal of Discourses*, 26 vols. (Liverpool: F. D. Richards, 1855–1886), 1:53–66. See also *Deseret News (Extra)*, September 14, 1852, 15; and Hubert H. Bancroft, *History of Utah*, reprint ed. (Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1964), 376.

26. In 1890, the U.S. Supreme Court upheld the legality of the Edmunds–Tucker Act. See U.S. Supreme Court, 140 U.S. 665, *Late Corporation of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints vs. United States*, May 19, 1890. For examinations of the anti-polygamy legislation see Larson, *The “Americanization” of Utah for Statehood*; Edward Leo Lyman, *Political Deliverance, The Mormon Quest for Utah Statehood* (Chicago: University of Illinois Press (1986); Edwin B. Firmage and Richard C. Mangrum, *Zion in the Courts* (Urbana, IL: University of Illinois Press, 2001), 139; and Edwin B. Firmage, “The Judicial Campaign against Polygamy and the Enduring Legal Questions,” *BYU Studies* 27, no. 3 (Summer 1987): 96.

27. Clarence Dutton, “Church and State in Utah,” *The Forum* 5 (May 1888): 320.

28. See Roberts, *Comprehensive History of the Church*, 3:417–21; William Alexander Linn, *The Story of the Mormons: From the Date of their Origin to the Year 1901* (New York: Macmillan, 1902) 428–32; and Larson, *The “Americanization” of Utah*, 217.

29. *Governor’s Message: A Candid Document Dealing Freely With Evils* (Salt Lake City, 1888), 2. See also Dutton, “Church and State in Utah,” 320–21.

30. Kate Field to Laurence Hutton, April 21, no year date given, L. Tom Perry Special Collections, Harold B. Lee Library, Brigham Young University, Provo, Utah (hereafter Perry Special Collections).

31. Joseph F. Smith remained in hiding from August 1884 until U.S. President Benjamin Harrison granted him amnesty in the fall of 1891. See Francis M. Gibbons, *Joseph F. Smith: Patriarch and Preacher, Prophet of God* (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book 1984), 130–32, 181–82.

32. Joseph F. Smith arrived in Kaysville, Utah, where President Taylor was in hiding, on July 18, 1887. Taylor passed away one week later. Under the leadership of Wilford Woodruff, the Quorum of the Twelve led the Church until the First Presidency was reorganized during the April 1889 General Conference. See Smith, *Life of Joseph F. Smith*, 287–88.

33. JFY to SYG, 3.

34. Lyman, *Political Deliverance*, 25.

35. See “Bishop Clawson in Court: How the Mormon Leaders Received His Sentence (The Full Text of the Polygamist’s Statement and of Judge Zane’s Reply Thereto),” *New York Times*, October 9, 1885.

36. Linford, “The Mormons and the Law,” 332. See also Nels Anderson, *Desert Saints: The Mormon Frontier in Utah* (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1942), 318.

37. See “Forward” by Brigham D. Madsen in R. N. Baskin, *Reminiscences of Early Utah with Reply to Certain Statements by O. F. Whitney* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 2006), ix.

38. *Ibid.*, ix, xviii; See also Joseph F. Smith to Martha Ann Smith (Harris), March 31,

- 1875, in Holzapfel and Whitchurch, eds., *“My Dear Sister; forthcoming (2013).*
39. See “The Statehood Question.” *Deseret Evening News*, January 28, 1889.
40. *Report of the Utah Commission to the Secretary of the Interior* (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1992), 23.
41. See McBride, “Utah and Mormonism,” 181–96.
42. JFS to SYG, 4.
43. “Miss Kate Field Dead,” *New York Tribune*, May 31, 1896.
44. Gary Scharnhorst, *Kate Field: The Many Lives of a Nineteenth-Century American Journalist* (Syracuse, NY: Syracuse University Press, 2008), 165, 197–98.
45. Her first published piece was a short poem in her father’s newspaper written at age nine. At the age twelve she began keeping a journal in which she recorded the usual childish thoughts and dreams, but also cogent commentary on local political situations, along with stanzas of poetry written by her father. See Lilian Whiting, *Kate Field: A Record* (Boston: Little, Brown, and Company, 1899) 3–10, 29–30; see also Scharnhorst, *Kate Field*, 10.
46. “Miss Katie Field Dead,” *The New York Times*, May 31, 1896.
47. Local newspapers recognized Field as an independent and well-known socialite. See Whiting, *Kate Field*, 54.
48. *Ibid.*, 148.
49. Kate Field to Laurence Hutton, November 25, 1883, Laurence Hutton Correspondence Collection, Princeton University, Princeton, New Jersey, photocopy in Perry Special Collections.
50. Scharnhorst, *Kate Field*, 160–61.
51. “The Situation in Utah” *Daily Graphic* (New York, NY), June 21, 1884, 844; also “Kate Field in Utah” *The Boston Herald*, January 27, 1884.
52. “Kate Field in Utah” *The Boston Herald*, January 27, 1884.
53. Kate Field to Laurence Hutton, December 18, 1884.
54. Leonard J. Arrington, *Kate Field and J. H. Beadle: Manipulators of the Mormon Past* (Salt Lake City: Center for Studies of the American West, University of Utah, 1971) 10.
55. Carolyn J. Moss, *Kate Field: Selected Letters* (Carbondale, IL: Southern Illinois University Press, 1996) 184.
56. Kate Field to Laurence Hutton, enclosure, April 21, no year given, original in Perry Special Collections.
57. Edward I. Mather, “Kate Field’s New Departure” *The Bay State Monthly* 3 (November 1885): 433.
58. JFS to SYG, 4.
59. The People’s Territorial Central Committee to J. B. Rosborough, Esq., Chairman Central Committee, Democratic Party of Utah, June 17, 1887, quoted in *Utah Statehood, Reasons Why it Should Not be Granted* (Salt Lake City: Tribune Print, 1887), 7; and Jedediah S. Rogers, ed., *In the President’s Office: The Diaries of L. John Nuttall, 1879–1892* (Salt Lake City: Signature Books, 201), 185–87.
60. Following a seventh bid, Utah was granted statehood by the U.S. Congress on January 4, 1896. For a more comprehensive discussion see Thomas G. Alexander, “The Odyssey of a Latter-day Prophet: Wilford Woodruff and the Manifesto of 1890,” in *Journal of Mormon History* 17 (1991): 169–206; also Larson, *The “Americanization” of Utah*, 217.
61. Johnson and Porter, *National Party Platforms*, 74.
62. See Larson, *The “Americanization” of Utah*, 284; and Kenneth N. Owens, “The Prizes of Statehood,” *Montana: The Magazine of Western History* 37 (Autumn 1987): 6.

63. Allan Nevis, comp., *Letters of Grover Cleveland, 1850–1908* (New York: DaCapo Press, 1970), v.

64. “Cleveland, Grover,” *Encyclopedia of Latter-day Saint History*, Donald Q. Cannon, Richard O. Cowan, and Arnold K. Garr, eds. (Salt Lake City: Deseret Book, 2001), 219–20.

65. One Latter-day Saint delegate in Washington, DC, reported that President Cleveland said the following about the Edmunds-Tucker Act: “Tell your people that [this] law shall not be harshly administered. While it is my duty to see it enforced, I promise that it shall be executed as other laws are, impartially, and in the spirit of justice and humanity,” as cited in Linford, “Mormons and the Law,” 325.

66. Smith and Penrose arrived in Washington, DC, in February of 1888, traveling under the pseudonyms “Jason Mack” and “Charles Williams” respectively. As members of the Quorum of the Twelve Apostles, in addition to working with political matters, they helped manage Church finances in the Washington, DC, area. They also presided over the missionaries and supervised immigration to Salt Lake City.

67. *Report of the Governor of Utah to the Secretary of the Interior* (Washington: Government Printing Office, 1888), 19–20.

68. Cannon and O’Higgins, *Under the Prophet*, 80.

69. See Larson, *The “Americanization” of Utah*, 232–46.

70. Cannon and O’Higgins, *Under the Prophet*, 73. A decade and a half later, Frank Cannon would apostatize from the Church. However, at this time he was in full fellowship and serving as a lobbyist for the Church in Washington, DC, assisting the territorial representative John T. Caine.

71. *Ibid.*, 79.

72. John M. Whitaker, Diary, February 28, 1887, as cited in Fred Collier, “The Political Platform of the Manifesto,” *Doctrine of the Priesthood*, vol. 4, no. 2, 16.

73. Cannon and O’Higgins, *Under the Prophet*, 80.

74. Gibbons, *Joseph F. Smith*, 158.

75. Grover Cleveland would go on to win a second term as president of the United States, the only president to serve two non-consecutive terms (1885–1889 and 1893–1897). It would be during President Cleveland’s second term as president that Utah would finally be granted statehood.

76. JFS to SYG, 3–4.

77. “Released from Prison,” *Deseret News*, February 23, 1889.

78. JFS to SYG, 4.

79. See Matthias Cowley, *Wilford Woodruff, Fourth President of the Church of Jesus Christ of Latter-day Saints: History of His Life and Labors as Recorded in His Daily Journals* (Salt Lake City: Bookcraft, 1964), 563–64; and Smith, *Life of Joseph F. Smith*, 288.

80. JFS to SYG, 5–6.

81. *Ibid.*, 4. Charles Penrose was one of many Mormons who had been tried and convicted under federal anti-polygamy laws. Cleveland pardoned several polygamists in his first term as president. See Orson F. Whitney, *History of Utah*, 4 vols. (Salt Lake City: G. Q. Cannon & Sons Co., 1892–1904), 3:545.

82. JFS to SYG, 4.

83. “Proclamation to the Mormons,” *New York Times*, September 28, 1894.

84. Lyman, *Political Deliverance*, 232.

85. JFS to SYG, 6.

86. Joseph F. Smith was sent to Washington, DC, twice between the spring of 1888 and 1889 on Church business in an ongoing effort to receive statehood. He refers to this trip

as “the gauntlet” because of constant efforts by federal marshals to arrest him for practicing plural marriage.

87. Joseph F. Smith would be pardoned by President Benjamin Harrison, along with other Church members who had practiced plural marriage, in January 1893. See “Amnesty,” *Deseret News*, January 5, 1893.

88. Jacob Forsberry Gates, husband of Susan (Susa) Amelia Young Gates.

89. Harvey Harris Gates was born to Susa and Jacob on January 19, 1889, in Laie, Oahu, Hawaii.

90. Elizabeth Ellen “Nellie” Solomon and her husband Frederick Beesley served as missionaries in Hawaii from October 1885 to April 1889.

91. Joseph F. Smith is referring to two sons born to Nellie and Fred Beesley while the couple was serving a mission in Hawaii. Fredrick Alfred (b. December 25, 1886), and Elmer Ebenezer Beesley (b. February 5, 1889) were both born in Laie, Oahu, Hawaii.

92. Harvey Harris Gates was the third child born to Susa and Jacob during their missionary service in Hawaii. The two older sons were Joseph Sterling Gates (b. February 28, 1886), and Brigham Cecil Gates (b. August 17, 1887).

93. A garret is an unfinished room on the top floor of a house; more typically an attic.

94. In 1884, Charles S. Zane was appointed the chief justice of the Utah Territorial Supreme Court and judge of the third judicial district, located in Salt Lake City. He, along with other federally appointed officials, sought grand jury indictments against Mormon polygamists under the Edmunds Act. See Thomas G. Alexander, “The Odyssey of a Latter-day Prophet,” 176.

95. At the time of this letter, Franklin S. Richards was the general counsel for the Church. In 1889, he was sent to Washington, DC, to ask newly elected President Benjamin Harrison to appoint territorial officials sympathetic to the Latter-day Saints.

96. “Casting up accounts with Neptune,” was a phrase used in the 1800s to mean ocean travel. Joseph F. Smith is making reference to Jacob and Susa Young Gates’s trip home from Hawaii by sea (i.e., Neptune, Roman mythological god of the sea).

97. Julina Lambson, first plural wife of Joseph F. Smith. Because of continued persecution against leaders of the Church, Smith was sometimes unable to see his family.

98. Lucy Bigelow, twenty-second wife of Brigham Young.

99. A Hawaiian salutation meaning “much love.”