

## Book Reviews

RICHARD NEITZEL HOLZAPFEL AND R. Q. SHUPE. ***Brigham Young: Images of a Mormon Prophet***. (Salt Lake City: Eagle Gate, 2000, xv + 320 pp, illustrations, index, \$39.95 hardback.)

*William W. Slaughter, a photo archivist, is the author of Camping Out in the Yellowstone 1882, Life in Zion, and Church History Timeline and is coauthor of Trail of Hope.*

Richard Holzapfel, an associate professor of Church History and Doctrine at Brigham Young University, has teamed with R. Q. Shupe, a southern California lawyer, to produce an enticing visual documentary of Brigham Young. Holzapfel and Shupe also coauthored the recently published *Joseph F. Smith: A portrait of a Prophet*.

Richard Holzapfel, in particular, has an impressive vita when it comes to the study of and use of historic photographs. He has pushed the study of history through photography in such books as *Church History in Black and White* (coauthored by T. Jeffery Cottle and Ted D. Stoddard), *Their Faces Toward Zion*, and, to a lesser degree, his early Mormon history series that includes *Old Mormon Nauvoo*, *Old Mormon Kirtland and Missouri*, and *Old Mormon Palmyra and New England* (all coauthored by T. Jeffery Cottle). Most recently, he is the photograph editor for *BYU Studies* and author of the groundbreaking series “Visual Images: Setting the Record Straight” in the *Journal of Mormon History*. “Groundbreaking” may seem a bit over the top until one considers that scholarly journals, for the most part, have decidedly eschewed the use of photographs even as decoration.

Holzapfel and Shupe are part of a generation of historians and other

scholars who value the photograph as historical evidence. For many past historians and writers, photographs were merely seasoning, salt and pepper if you will, for an article or book—nothing to be taken seriously. This is not to say that photography has been totally ignored as evidence to push a point. Mathew Brady showed Americans the horrors of Civil War battles. Indeed, William H. Jackson's spectacular photographs helped decide the establishment of Yellowstone National Park. During the Great Depression, such photographers as Dorothea Lange, Walker Evans, Ben Shahn, and Russell Lee were sent out to document the conditions of America's many disinherited; such photographic efforts impacted the decisions of government and business leaders. Photograph historians point to two books as early examples of using photographs to pointedly amplify text: *Let Us Now Praise Famous Men* (1941) by James Agee and Walker Evans and *You Have Seen Their Faces* (1937) by Erskine Caldwell and Margaret Bourke-White.

Yet, despite these pioneering efforts, historians have been somewhat slow in understanding the documentary value and use of photographs. In fact, it *was* quite common for publishers to select photographs to include in publications. Now the reverse is occurring—more and more, publishers require writers to supply images for their books or articles. And the images must support the text—not just “season” the book.

In *Brigham Young: Images of a Mormon Prophet*, Holzapfel and Shupe have combined photographs, illustrations, art, and words to bring Brother Brigham into clear focus for the modern reader/viewer. Text and image combine to bring us closer to understanding Brigham Young as a complete man—image reinforcing text, text reinforcing image. All this is enhanced by the publisher's beautiful and unique design of the volume.

The book is organized into “three distinct sections: an overview of Brigham Young's life from 1801 to 1848 that helps set the stage for the images and text that follow; an introductory essay entitled ‘Now We See but a Poor Reflection’; and the main body of the book identified as ‘The Image.’ This last section is divided into five subsections covering specific periods of time: ‘Part One: 1840s,’ ‘Part Two: 1850s,’ ‘Part Three: 1860s,’ ‘Part Four: 1870s,’ and ‘Part Five: Death and Beyond’” (9).

The “Overview” (section one) is, frankly, just that—nothing more but maybe less. A mere four and a half pages, it quickly points out the highlights of President Young's life: birth, family, marriage, conversion to Mormonism, mission, the Missouri experience, England, Joseph Smith's murder, Young's ascension to leadership, and the Saints' initial move to the West. Although it seems somewhat inadequate, the overview does serve to move the reader quickly into the main sections of the volume. Truthfully, most readers will appreciate this thrust into the meat of the matter.

The section entitled “Now We See but a Poor Reflection” (taken from 1 Corinthians 13:12) is noted as Dr. Holzapfel’s composition. This well-documented section is guided by the author’s question, “What did people expect to see when they first met Brigham Young?” and the author’s statement that “[H]is contemporaries . . . left word pictures as they tried to describe him for themselves and their audiences” (19). What follows is a *tour de force* of “word images” of Brigham Young. The remarkable variety of positive and negative voices include non-Mormon Argonauts bound for the gold fields, journalists, foreign travelers, and military leaders as well as Mormon converts, immigrants, and leaders. Holzapfel nicely juxtaposes the statements of luminaries such as Horace Greeley, Mark Twain, Howard Stansbury, and General William T. Sherman with the lesser known, including that of a young girl: “[A]fter Sunday School, President Young asked all the children to come up and shake hands with him. He was always very kind and affectionate with children. When I went up to him he put his arm around my neck and kissing me, said: ‘You are a sweet, beautiful child.’ I suppose he must have told the other children the same thing, but it made me very proud and happy” (43).

In speaking of the positive and negative descriptions of President Young, Holzapfel points out that “like the ancient mirror, these contemporary views of Brigham are often biased and sometimes provide an imperfect reflection” (19). When writing about negative images of Young, Holzapfel points out that Thomas Brown Holmes Stenhouse and Fanny Stenhouse were once important to the Mormon cause but discarded their faith and “published books that helped to create the negative images of Brigham and the Church.” Rather than relate the Stenhouses’ fallen view of Young and Mormonism, Holzapfel merely follows the above statement with their positive evaluation of Young’s handling of the 1856 handcart disasters.

Dr. Holzapfel also points out that “when the Church announced its belief in and practice of plural marriage, the national media found a story they could not leave alone” (31). However, it would have been informative if Holzapfel had analyzed the change in descriptions of Brigham by non-Mormon visitors from generally positive in the 1850s to progressively more negative in the 1860s and 1870s. What were observing visitors noting and highlighting in the 1850s in comparison with visiting wayfarers in the 1860s and 1870s? Did their expectations match “meeting the man?” How much did the national press determine the expectations of visitors versus what they really saw? Unfortunately, with the exception of expectations, these questions are never asked and therefore never answered.

Despite this inadequacy, this section is a wonderful read and leads nicely into “The Images.” This portion is filled with “genuine daguerreotypes,

ambrotypes, tintypes, stereo views, . . . authentic oil paintings, engravings, and handcrafted woodcut illustrations” (79). In locating images, the authors mined the usual rich lodes: LDS Archives, BYU, U of U, and Utah State Historical Society. However, what makes this volume outstanding are the many seldom-seen and some never-before-seen images Holzapfel and Shupe located from a variety of not-so-usual sources. As when I am back-country skiing and see a winter landscape beautiful beyond words, all I seem to be able to say for this section is “WOW!” and “DOUBLE WOW!!”

Divided into five parts, “Images” visually covers Young’s life from the 1840s through his death in 1877 and includes “Death and Beyond.” Each decade begins with a “Brigham Young Chronology” and includes numerous quick-read sidebars of interesting tidbits—slices of life—concerning Brigham Young and/or photography. One example includes an 1862 statement from Young to the Saints: “I shall soon be sixty-one years of age, and my spirit is more vigorous and powerful to-day than it has been in any day I ever saw; it is more quick to comprehend, more ready to discern, the understanding is more matured, more correct in judgment, the memory more vivid and enduring and discretion more circumspect. . . . I am better now than I was twenty years ago” (160).

Throughout this section, images are accompanied by germane interpretations, of various length, that allow the reader a broader experience than a mere look at an unexplained photograph. For example, the authors give a visual history of an etching: “[T]his steel engraving of W. H. Gibbs is based on a sketch, probably watercolor, by Frederick H. Piercy. It first appeared in a book published by Franklin Dewey Richards (1821–1899) and edited by James Linforth (1827–1899), *Route from Liverpool to Great Salt Lake Valley* (Liverpool: Franklin D. Richards, 1855), following p. 112. The book was published in Liverpool, England, in fifteen monthly parts from July 1854 to September 1855. It is now considered one of the most beautiful books on Mormonism published in the nineteenth century” (130).

Sprinkled throughout “Images” are readable essays about the various photographic processes and a little more: daguerreotypes, coloring daguerreotypes, ambrotypes, photojournalism, glass negatives and albumen prints, card photographs, photo albums, tintypes, and stereographs. These essays, most borrowed and credited to other authors, painlessly give us a feel for the evolution of one of mankind’s most important inventions. These all add to our appreciating the wonderment of looking into Brother Brigham’s eyes 123 years after his death.

Smack in the middle of the volume is a sixteen-page section of color images, including paintings, carte de visites with rich sepia hues, and hand-painted daguerreotypes, ambrotypes, and tintypes. The simple and elegant layout only adds to the individual beauty of the color plates, creating a visu-

al feast for the reader. Frankly, this section alone more than justifies the price of the book.

In a volume with such a large amount of data, it is inevitable that some mistakes will crop up. For the most part, the book is well and correctly documented, although, at times, the authors incorrectly identify where they obtained images. For example, in about a dozen cases, the authors credit LDSCA (LDS Church Archives) when they should credit the Church Library or Church Museum. Also, for images from published books, magazines, and newspapers, it is correct and proper to credit only the published source—for example, “Plate 80 (Left) . . . Illustration, 2 1/2 x 2 3/4” (6.4 cm x 7 cm), 1872, From Mark Twain, *Roughing It* (Hartford, Conn: American Publishing, 1872), 113, LDSCA” (230). All is fine and consistent except for “LDSCA,” which is not needed because one can find the 1872 edition of *Roughing It* at a variety of institutions. This may seem trivial; but, in this case, if a researcher were to go to the LDS Church Archives in hopes of locating a copy of *Roughing It* or any other published items, he or she would be disappointed because the Archives houses no *published* items. The authors probably located Twain’s book in the Church Library.

In writing this review, I consulted with LDS Church Senior Archivist W. Randall Dixon, whose expertise about historic Salt Lake City is second to none. He pointed out two mistakes worth noting. First, on page 116, is the reproduction of the daguerreotype of the 1853 groundbreaking for the Salt Lake Temple. The authors state the image is “taken from the Council House.” However, this image is most likely taken from the Tithing Storehouse and “definitely not the Council House.” Second, on page 153, Holzapfel and Shupe locate the Savage and Ottinger Studio “on the east side of Main Street, between First and Second South in Salt Lake City.” They are close, but not on target—the Studio was located on the west side of Main Street, between South Temple and First South.

The authors, like anyone brave enough to be published, have made a few mistakes that should not and do not detract from the considerable impact of this book. In their conclusion, Holzapfel and Shupe nicely summarize the mission of their book: “[P]hotography had its limitations. Yet, more than one hundred years later, as we carefully examine the Mormon prophet’s face preserved on the flat surfaces of these nineteenth-century artifacts, it is not difficult to visualize him walking, breathing, and talking. Looking into Brigham’s eyes as he stares back at us through the magic of photography, we see him come alive again in our mind’s eye, and we feel an uncanny familiarity with him” (312). They have successfully created a beautiful book in which the reader can truly journey back in time and meet Brigham Young. Well done!

~~~~~

DAVID L. BIGLER AND WILL BAGLEY, eds. *Army of Israel, Mormon Battalion Narratives*. (Spokane, Washington: The Arthur H. Clark Company, 2000, 492 pp., illustrations, maps, bibliography, index, \$39.95 hardback.)

DAVID L. BIGLER AND WILL BAGLEY, eds. *Army of Israel, Mormon Battalion Narratives*. (Logan, Utah: Utah State University Press, 2000, 540 pp., illustrations, maps, bibliography, index, \$24.95 paper.)

*Norma Baldwin Ricketts is author of several books and articles on Mormon history in California from 1844 to 1860. Her major work, The Mormon Battalion: U.S. Army of the West, 1846–1848, won Westerners International's top award for the best book on western history published in 1996. She lives in Mesa, Arizona.*

When war was declared between Mexico and the United States by President James K. Polk on 13 May 1846, about fifteen thousand Mormons were struggling along three hundred miles between the Mississippi River and Council Bluffs, Iowa. They had been persecuted, mobbed, and driven from their homes in Nauvoo, Illinois. Under the leadership of Brigham Young, they were seeking a religious refuge in the American West away from the United States, which had provided no protection.

Brigham Young, aware of the starving, suffering people, sent Jesse C. Little to Washington, D.C., to appeal to the government for aid. Little offered to haul army supplies and to build military forts. However, his offers were declined. President Polk, advised by Amos Kendall and Thomas Kane, decided to ask for five hundred Mormon volunteers to enlist in the Army of the West under the command of Stephen W. Kearny. After the treatment they had received at the hands of the mobs in the immediate past, Mormon men were hesitant to enlist for a year of wartime service. Many were suspicious it was another means of destroying them. They also were reluctant to leave their families in destitute and uncertain wilderness conditions. However, Brigham Young and the other leaders decided there were benefits from accepting Polk's offer—namely, the monthly clothing allowance plus the soldiers' pay would provide money to outfit the Saints on their long journey west. By serving in the army, Mormons ensured their loyalty would not be questioned, and the result placed five hundred men in California at no cost to the Mormons. Young also negotiated for the Mormons to stay on land belonging to the Pottawatomie and Omaha Nations. Hearing the words of their leaders, the murmuring stopped. In a little over two weeks, the requested number of volunteers had signed up. Subsequently, their two-thousand-mile march to San Diego took on epic proportions, as indicated by a later

statement of their commanding officer, Colonel Philip St. George Cooke: "History may be searched in vain for an equal march of infantry."

These untrained infantry soldiers secured a place in history in unexpected ways as they participated in a wide spectrum of events. In California, the command arrived too late to take part in the battles of American occupation, but their presence alone aided greatly in the conquest of the West. The good behavior and industry of Battalion members accomplished far more than their muskets in gaining trust in the new government and its intention to defend the rights and interests of all its citizens. When Company B was sent to San Diego for the peacetime occupation, the other four companies were sent to Los Angeles with the exception of Lt. Robert Clift, Company C. He was assigned to Company B in San Diego to assist the *alcalde* and citizens in understanding and adapting to American military rule.

When Lt. Samuel Thompson took twenty men and several Mexican guides eighteen miles north of Los Angeles to stop attacks on ranches in the hills by the Tulareños Indians, the guides found the Indians about dark; and Thompson ordered his men to attack. The conflict lasted about two hours with six Indians killed and two soldiers slightly wounded. After the Indians fled, the Mexicans scalped five of the Indians in brutal fashion before Thompson knew what they were doing (e.g., 209). The natives had been receiving bounty pay for Indian scalps. Clift issued an order that these Mexicans were to receive no bounty and that scalping was to stop immediately. After about six weeks, Clift was made *alcalde* of San Diego (e.g., 222, fn 79, 84).

As a military unit, the Battalion was unique in that its five companies were composed of all Mormons—except for a handful—serving under both military and religious authority, as Brigham Young had selected company captains. Between 1846 and 1848, they participated in events that shaped the nation's destiny and lives of the people. They blazed four viable roads totaling two thousand miles, taking wagons over them for the first time—a southern wagon road across the deserts of the southwest to California, which helped bring about the Gadsden Purchase; the opening of the Mormon-Carson Trail in the Sierra for two hundred thousand Forty-Niners who followed; and the establishment of the Old Spanish Trail and the Salt Lake cut-off. They reached the site of the Donner Party tragedy and buried the remains. Their presence at the discovery of gold at Sutter's Mill provided the only written accounts of the event. The epic march of the Battalion demonstrated the Mexican claim to the Southwest to be as problematic as that of the United States, which purchased this vast territory in the Treaty of Guadalupe Hidalgo at the war's end. Several soldiers' journals include an



unusual amount of documentary evidence for that era.

Although the Mormon Battalion earned a prominent place on the pages of western history, their contributions have remained in relative anonymity for many years. This situation has changed in the last decade with the publication of several outstanding journals and accounts of their western trek. The story of the Mormon Battalion reaches out to different genre—military enthusiasts, political advocates, trail buffs, social interpreters, and LDS Church historians—as well as touches all the states through which the Battalion traveled to reach California. The Battalion contributed greatly to the history of the American West, and yet great portions of its history had not been written previously. Few historians are better qualified for this task than David L. Bigler and Will Bagley, who are producing outstanding chronicles on western history, individually and jointly.

Mr. Bigler won the Utah State Historical Society's Dale L. Morgan Award. His *Forgotten Kingdom: The Mormon Theocracy in the American West, 1847–1896*, the second volume in the Kingdom-in-the-West series (Arthur H. Clark Company), won the Best Book Award for 1998 from Westerners International. He also edited *The Gold Discovery Journal of Azariah Smith*. He is past president, Oregon-California Trails Association. He served on the Utah Board of State History and is a former officer of the Friends of University of Utah Libraries. Since 1986, he has devoted full time to the study of Utah and western history. He lives in Roseville, California.

Will Bagley has edited several historical narratives, including *Frontiersman: Abner Blackburn's Narrative*. With Harold Schindler, he revised Dale L. Morgan's classic *West from Fort Bridger*. Mr. Bagley is the editor of the Arthur H. Clark Company series *Kingdom in the West: The Mormons and the American Frontier*, whose first volume, *The Pioneer Camp of the Saints: The 1847 Mormon Trail Journals of Thomas Bullock*, won the 1997 Stephen F. Christensen award for the Best Documentary from the Mormon History Association. He also completed the third volume in the Kingdom-in-the-West series: *Scoundrel's Tale, The Samuel Brannan Papers*. He lives in Salt Lake City.

With the publication of *Army of Israel, Mormon Battalion Narratives*, readers are supplied with a superbly written account that succeeds brilliantly in identifying the larger political and military roles of the Battalion. Editors Bigler and Bagley share a cache of first-hand accounts, unpublished documents, and other primary sources relating to the historic journey of the Mormon Battalion. Military and government documents included are particularly valuable in helping historians assess the Battalion's role. After years of research in widely scattered locations (which most readers and many historians could not accomplish), the editors have uncovered a treasure trove



of previously unavailable material, giving priority to the new documents. Careful comments throughout provide a detailed explanatory text.

When controversy is present, the editors tell both sides of the situation—without attempting to persuade the reader to either viewpoint. As an example, in a deviance from standard practice, the Church called special bishops to “take care of the families who were left by the soldiers.” Each “bishop” was assigned four or five families to care for. In some instances, this plan worked out fine; however, in many cases, the wives suffered from lack of food during the winter. When the Battalion volunteers left Council Bluffs, they understood their individual pay would go directly to soldiers’ families. Young told the wives that making collective purchases in St. Louis allowed the church to buy “twice as much...than the people could buy themselves.” Brigham Young, with thousands of starving people, saw a broader picture of providing food to as many as possible. This practice of distributing goods purchased by soldiers’ money often left battalion wives with less than they needed, which was true with other families who received help. Included are touching letters from wives telling of their plite, pleading with their husbands to send their money directly to them instead of by courier. (e.g., 80-84). Both sides of this controversy are presented. Young’s promise to the departing soldiers that he would take care of their wives was a source of contention, particularly for the first two years after the soldiers returned. Brigham Young later acknowledged that money from the battalion greatly helped the saints reach Salt Lake Valley. (e.g., 80-84).

Sources are clearly cited in this well-written and organized volume. The subjects covered are set forth in an orderly process. Many footnotes give biographical data about individual soldiers, and the information makes each soldier more than a name on a flat sheet of paper (e.g., 284, fn 15). In their footnotes, the editors tie together modern locality places to names used by the soldiers in 1846—simplifying, for the reader, the location of where certain events took place. Several well-defined maps accompany the text. Of particular importance is Cooke’s Wagon Road (e.g., 144). Cooke took the first wagons over the last 250 miles of trails to California, creating what later became a vital east-west trade route.

The best parts of the book for this reviewer are the answers to many questions about the Battalion the book provides—whether it be additional information about an important event or merely an insignificant fact I have wondered about. For example, Mormon annals tell of the friendship of Thomas Kane during several crucial periods. Kane traveled to Council Bluffs specifically to encourage the Mormon men to enlist in the Battalion. Included are the fascinating details of the Thomas Kane-Mormon relationship from his very first contact with Mormonism (e.g., 54-63). Through doc-

uments, particularly in a letter to his parents, Kane reveals his feelings for the Mormons and his ambitions for himself—all of which will give the readers an intimate knowledge of why he was sympathetic, why he was a champion for the Saints, and how he was going to use the relationship when he returned east.

Editors Bigler and Bagley's research is deep and comprehensive. Readers may ask, after finishing *Army of Israel*, what more could be left? History constantly reveals itself. The editors are the first to point out there are soldiers' journals, known to exist, that have not been found. There are areas that need more research—for example, the Pueblo period (e.g., 277) and the interaction between the Indians and the soldiers. True historians, the editors encourage others to build on their narrative as more journals and other primary sources come forth.

*Army of Israel* is an accurate, expansive portrait of a large part of the West from Iowa to California during a critical period in its development. Readers will study this book over and over, each time reveling in its depth and integrity while recognizing the diverse contributions of the Mormon Battalion in the settlement of the West. This is a splendid documentary history.